City of Charlottesville Efficiency Study Recommendations
City Staff Comments

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
	Citywide/Continuous Improvement/Strategic Areas	
1	Develop a prioritized annual work plan to strategically guide organizational efforts	This recommendation will help staff and Council further enhance and implement those efforts that are already underway. For example, City Council recently started work on a Strategic Plan refresh which will have improved reporting and measurement capability. This new Strategic Plan will build off of the current Strategic Plan and be effective as of July 1, 2017. If this plan is to be the guide for the City along with other tools we have in place such as the annual budget, that would be very helpful for all - Council, staff and the community - to help guide the direction of the City and communicating those priorities.
2	Implement a Budget Development system	Budget Office staff have for a while now been looking at best practices in the form of new software and applications to help in these areas. We will continue to pursue these options and cost them out for future budget processes.
3	Utilize the results of the Employee Satisfaction Survey to prioritize organizational improvement initiatives	Some of this has been done in the past. For instance, the employee parking benefit resulted from the results of a previous employee survey as did the Employee Appreciation Lunch and the use of smaller surveys to drive specific changes/issues such as those around benefits and pay. And, as a result of the survey done in 2014, staff held several meetings with employees to talk about the results and next steps. That was the first time that had been done following an employee survey. From those meetings and the input heard by staff, the Office of Budget and Performance Management decided to hold employee focus groups as part of the feedback loop for the preparation of the FY 2018 budget. Those focus sessions have been very fruitful and employees seem to appreciate being asked for their input into a process that has usually been quite a mystery. While more work needs to be done linking the results to actual action items in a more comprehensive way, staff has already begun this and can work to expand these initiates further using already in place valuable resources, such as the iTeam (innovation team) and the Employee Appreciation Committee.
4	Update the City's employee recognition program to align with the City's values and goals	This is currently underway and has been a staff effort for several months now. Called Doin' Good, this initiative will allow employees to recognize other employees for their good work as related to the organizational values. This initiative is ready to roll out very soon. Another committee has been working on a citywide pay for performance program for several months now as well. This program is under review now that the committee has submitted some recommendations. When that will roll out is still to be determined.
5	Conduct a survey to assess satisfaction with internal City services	Several departments already do some version of an internal survey - two examples in particular include Information Technology (Help Desk user survey), and Facilities Maintenance (custodial services user survey). There are other areas that can benefit from a survey and staff will be looking at these areas and how they can also implement survey tools.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
6	Automate the City's agenda development process through the use of an agenda management software system	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

Voting Registrar

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
7	Track workload in the Office of the General Registrar to determine most efficient allocation of personnel resources	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

S.A.P./Citywide

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
8	Create a dedicated SAP Support Center	There is agreement that additional FTE's are needed to support and enhance S.A.P. However, there is not agreement that putting those FTEs in I.T. makes sense. I.T. provides S.A.P. technical support in the same manner we do all other software systems. To be effective, each department should be the "owner" of their S.A.P. module(s) to provide the necessary functional knowledge and project prioritization. The primary obstacle to leveraging S.A.P. is the lack of departmental staff to participate in requirements gathering and functional testing.

Risk Management/Procurement

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
9	Create a centralized risk management training program focused on reducing workplace injury	There is general agreement with this recommendation, but there needs to be a more detailed discussion about what efforts are done on a centralized, coordinated basis by Risk Management, what is done by the Safety Committee and individual departments and the resources that would need to be behind this effort.
10	Create an additional centralized Buyer position in Procurement	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
11	Create turnaround time goals and track time associated with each stage of the procurement process.	There is general agreement with this recommendation but much thought will need to go into the statistics the City tracks, or wants to track, to make this a useful and meaningful exercise and decisions making tool.
12	Increase available training opportunities for City personnel involved in procurement	Given the decentralized nature of procurement in the City, staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored to ensure compliance and the needs of the end-user are met.

City Assessor

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
	Convert the annual property assessment process to a biennial assessment process	Staff disagrees with this recommendation. Typically, communities which are having revenue stresses are recommended to go to annual assessments to try and capture real estate upside more quickly. The Assessor's Office is now fully staffed and the new assessor is re-examining how they do business. It is also an unknown as to how this impacts the City's largest revenue source and would be a radical shift.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
	Information Technology - Cost Allocation and Staffing	
14	Adjust existing cost allocation model to more equitably distribute IT service costs among departments	Currently, the fee allocation process for IT's 6 funds takes two months. Data must be merged from 4 different systems (City Network, I.T. Helpdesk, S.A.P. and Telephone Billing system) with results being validated by departments. Novak's cost allocation methods may have been effective 10-15 years ago, or in organizations with a less sophisticated infrastructure but would not be effective for the City. For example: Infrastructure costs attributable to storage - the model recommended assumes that the cost for all storage is the same. At the City, we use Storage Area Network (SAN) technology to dynamically shift data from slow storage (cheap) to faster storage (expensive) based on frequency of use. It would be impractical to measure true cost attributable to each department. Additionally, charging our customers based solely on the raw storage count would encourage them to limit the data they store in ways that may jeopardize business continuity. The proposed model would seek to charge according to switch port counts which is even less relevant to the City's IT infrastructure. For instance, the report suggests calculating the cost of telephone services by the dedicated switches used. This methodology was used for PBX technology. The City has a converged infrastructure that uses the same switches to deliver all network services (data, internet, telephony, CCTV, etc.). To properly leverage technology, we must focus on ensuring each department has what it needs to do their work instead of trying to allocate costs. I.T. Services are as integral a part of the business as Finance and Human Resources. Instead of adding complexity to a cost allocation model that may have out lived its usefulness, the organization may be better served by eliminating the administrative overhead of fee calculation for General Fund departments and add I.T. support as part the administrative fee charged to non-general fund departments and agencies (e.g. Library).
15	Create a Public Safety Business Analyst position to coordinate help desk and business process issues with the Police and Fire Departments	Police, Fire and IT have discussed this concept over the last few years. IT is generally in favor of the idea since the Helpdesk workload and project complexity has drastically increased over the last 5 years with no additional FTEs. However, the cost indication may not be realistic. Additionally, a person with that level of knowledge and experience would only be suitable to address base-line user support. The functions that better align with a true IT Business Analyst would command a significantly higher salary due to the education, skills and experience needed to be successful in this role.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
16	Evaluate Help Desk staffing and workload	As clarification, City I.T. uses an in-house developed tracking system to assign and monitor progress of most customer requests. Currently only the S.A.P. Software Engineer posts time to S.A.P. internal orders. Not all requests are entered into the system. If the technician can answer the question or resolve the issue quickly, a ticket is not entered in order to reduce administrative overhead. Some staff are diligent documenters and others are not. Additionally, the counts don't accurately reflect the Helpdesk support required by each department since all requests for IT services are routed through the Helpdesk. A large number of support requests are routed to systems, network and applications engineers and others are projects involving multiple teams. Looking at the average number of days to complete a request is highly misleading since it does not take into account the complexity of an issue or delays caused for reasons outside I.T. control. For example, the average annual tickets for the Police Department only include one request for the implementation of the new CAD which was a huge drain on the entire I.T. Operations Team resources (Helpdesk, Systems and Networking).I agree that an evaluation should be done on I.T. workload versus resources. I think it would be valuable to do a complete review of services offered, resources available (with a skills assessment). We plan to begin by contracting with InfoTech (an I.T. industry research group) to do an assessment of the Helpdesk team to serve as a baseline.

Human Resources

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
17	Enhance the capacity and role of departmental HR liaisons through a dedicated ongoing training program	Staff agrees with this and some steps are already in place to establish this.
18	Require mandatory management and supervisory training for Charlottesville managers and supervisors	Staff agrees that training needs to be mandatory. This training has been in place for a number of years but not mandatory. Will also look at ways to continue to enhance the tools available to managers and supervisors.
19	Develop a formal organizational development policy and program for the Human Resources Department	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
20	Create a centralized workforce planning strategy and assign implementation responsibilities to departments	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
21	Implement employee retention best practices as part of workforce planning efforts	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
22	Implement recruitment process improvements and cycle time targets	Report states that 70 days is excessive and staff believes that is a reasonable target given the nature of the process. Some clarification is needed on the application process. Applications are screened by NeoGov using applicants' responses to questions submitted with their applications. Departments do have responsibility for identifying those applicants who will be offered an interview. It is their responsibility to ensure the applicants' statements about their qualifications are supported by the work experience they list on their job application. The review by HR at the time of the job offer is to ensure this has occurred. Failure to do so can result in hiring offers being rescinded which negatively affects not only the department but the applicant as well. Staff will review this recommendation further and make any adjustments that will improve the process which will include working with departments on their timelines and other processes.
23	Revise recruitment and hiring process to eliminate final HR Director approval of all hires	The previous City Manager put this policy in place many years ago to ensure that departments were complying with personnel policies, requests were within budget, the hiring process had been followed, etc. In addition, the vacant Compensation Analyst position job description was rewritten and advertised as a Sr. Human Resource Analyst which will include the compensation analyst job duties as well as others that will assist in responding to some of the study's recommendations which will include working with departments on the initial and final review.
24	Implement the practice of conducting employee performance reviews annually	Agree and there is a staff committee in place ready to recommendation a pay for performance system to the City Manager and department heads.
25	Conduct a classification and compensation study	Staff agrees with this recommendation and funding was already identified to do this.

Neighborhood Development Services

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
26	Engage the development community in a process to identify development review reforms	NDS initiated this recommendation in February 2016. As a matter of fact, the development community has folded the Developers Roundtable Forum started by NDS into a formal countywide interest organization. NDS Director meets with the organization from time to time. The idea is to discuss mutual ways of addressing improvement to the review process. The development review process will always be a work in process. The developer's roundtable can be utilized to provide feedback and suggestions.
27	Designate an Assistant City Manager as the owner of the City's development review process and Chair of the Pre Development Meeting.	Staff agrees that a comprehensive review of the development process is necessary. Staff agrees that a consistent process that ensures responses to applicants that have been reached through a cooperative inter-departmental process is absolutely critical. Staff would like to further explore the efficacy of the model suggested and the connection to the City Manager's office.
28	Implement a new development services software system	NDS completed an internal review process of the development review and decided that it needs new software that would improve review process, including serving as a management tool. A CIP funding request has been submitted for implementation and currently being considered.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
29	Begin tracking workload data in order to make informed staffing adjustments	Consultant noted the need for data collection; however, they did not recommend the type of data and modality for collection. We request that the consultant provide a plan which denotes the data which should be collected and a timetable for implementing the data collection. (It will need to be done over time and not all at once)
30	Establish a practice and process for annually reviewing and adjusting the fee structure for Neighborhood Development Services	The recommendation is okay, resources would need to be provided to do a study (similar to the one Albemarle did) in order to get the details requested. Until then, we will do the best we can in house.
	Parks and Recreation/Golf	
31	Create a Parks and Recreation Master Plan	Staff concurs with this recommendation. While funding has not been approved for such a survey and Parks and Recreation Leadership staff determined several weeks ago to manage the current FY17 budget in a manner to accomplish this survey within existing funding during FY17, anticipating that the carryover request would not be approved. Staff has the ability and experience to design the survey instrument and we will work through the procurement process to engage a firm to conduct the survey. Such a survey is the foundation of a community-wide Master Plan; the data it provides informs decisions regarding community values, desires and needs. The remainder of the Master Planning process can be accomplished in-house with existing staff and potentially the engagement of an on-call design firm to assist with graphical products.
32	Expand time tracking activities related to horticulture and mowing maintenance	Staff concurs with this recommendation. Staff has also been working for many months on a database system that will provide for scalable and relational analyses of all maintenance functions within the Department. The database is now complete and staff will begin populating it over this coming winter. It currently includes all horticulture functions and when complete will contain all maintenance functions: turf, custodial, golf course, aquatics, playgrounds and recreational facilities. The database can also be used by other City Departments as a tool to track other maintenance responsibilities.
33	Establish service levels and maintenance schedules for custodial staff	Staff concurs with this recommendation and is currently working on this. Please see comments related to Recommendation 32- these are closely aligned.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
34	Formalize recreation program utilization goals and track utilization rates	Staff concurs with the overall recommendation but disagrees with the consultant's recommendation regarding the scholarship program. Regardless, the establishment of formal cost recovery goals for programs, services and facility access has long been a goal of the Department and as fiscal realities continue to impose difficult budgetary decisions, it is a critical step. Additionally, should City Parks and Recreation begin the process of seeking national accreditation, these standards are a required Accreditation element entitled 'Comprehensive Revenue Policy'. Staff disagrees that the scholarship program in place currently is a barrier to participation. We believe it has been very successful. There are currently 607 City resident households in the program, providing access to facilities, programs, classes and camps. In FY16 over $130,000 in value was received by those in the scholarship program for access passes, summer pool passes, classes, camps, etc. It should be noted that prior to the opening of the Smith Aquatic and Fitness Center in 2010, the City's scholarship program only provided for a 50% discount on the price of a class and did not provide any mechanism for facility access.
35	Establish annual cost recovery goals for golf operations and subsidize shortfalls in golf course revenue	Staff concurs with this recommendation and anticipates the beginning of this conversation to occur in the current FY18 budget process.

Public Works/General Organization/Infrastructure

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
36	Create an Operations Division in the Department of Public Works	The study underestimates the complexity of the missions of the Facilities Development and Facilities Maintenance divisions, and overestimates the necessity and benefits of coordination between Facilities and other Public Works operational units. Recommend that an Operations Division organizational chart exclude Facilities, and that the Facilities division(s) continue to report directly to the Public Works Director.
37	Create an Asset Management Division in the Department of Public Works	The intent of this recommendation will enable the department to accomplish mission critical objectives outlined in Recommendations 46 and 47. However, the recommendation to move Utilities Department GIS personnel to Public Works overlooks the interaction between GIS personnel and Utilities operations. Utilities assets are many and complex, and there are federal and state regulatory requirements which must be met; the Public Works Department would become, in effect, a manager of the Utility assets. It is also questionable whether the existing personnel would have the capacity to continue providing their current level of service to support Utility operations while achieving the years-long effort to implement Recommendations 46 and 47.
38	Create an Engineering Division in the Public Works Department	This will require extensive discussion and work between NDS, Public Works and Utilities to determine the feasibility and pros and cons of this recommendation.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
39	Create a Traffic function within the Engineering Division of the Department of Public Works	This will require extensive discussion and work between NDS, Public Works and Utilities to determine the feasibility and pros and cons of this recommendation.
40	Consolidate stormwater utility management in the Department of Public Works	The departments believe that this recommendation warrants a more extensive exploration of the pros and cons than has been provided and the feasibility recognizing the stormwater utility is an enterprise fund and the use of these funds is strictly dictated by the state enabling legislature.
41	Locate the Environmental Sustainability Division in the Department of Public Works	This will require extensive discussion and work between Public Works and Utilities to determine the feasibility and pros and cons of this recommendation.
42	Transfer one Safety and Training Coordinator position from the Utilities Department to the Public Works Department	The priority of the safety coordinators is to implement the required federal and state gas training programs. Both positions have been difficult to fill given the available applicant pool and other gas FTEs have had to fill the role at determent to their current roles and responsibilities. With a new emphasis on federal and state regulatory compliance, the plan is to fill the other position and both positions will concentrate on gas priorities and needs in the future. Further discussion will need to be done between Public Works and Utilities to determine the feasibility and pros and cons of this recommendation.

Utilities/Organizational Structure

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
43	Create a Gas Division of the Utilities Department	Regarding recommendations 43, 44, and 45, Utilities has concerns about these
44	Create a Water/Wastewater Division of the Utilities Department	recommendations. The current organizational structure fosters close coordination and
45	Create an Administration Division of the Utilities Department	cross training which provides institutional resiliency. The formation of three divisions has the potential to create separation and barriers, thus unnecessarily "siloing" a structure that is effective in its current arrangement.

Public Works/Work Planning and Tracking

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
46	Create a comprehensive asset management plan for all Public Works Department assets	This recommendation will require extensive work between many departments to determine the feasibility and pros and cons.
47	Implement a work order system	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
48	Include yard waste collection in the refuse collection contract	Currently, citizens have the option to either bag yard waste for collection by our refuse contractor (which is landfilled) or to call in a Large Item Pickup (which is then composted). To ensure that all materials are composted, a separate city-wide collection effort would need to be performed. Assuming a monthly collection were provided, the roughly estimated cost (based on half our cost for recycling) would be ~$150,000/year, to provide a service which is not in demand. This additional service would not eliminate the need for collection of large branches via the Large Item Pickup program.
49	Improve efficiency of leaf collection by utilizing the refuse contractor	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
50	Shift maintenance responsibility for select Fire Department fleet to Fleet Management Division	The department is concerned by the conclusion of the study. The current mechanic-to-equipment ration is 1:93, on the high end of the recommended range. The addition of 18 vehicles would bring that ratio to 1:95. Further, the advanced age, poor condition and highly specialized nature of much of our fleet asset pool represent a significant challenge and affect the acceptable range. See recommendation #81 for more information.
51	Staff the Facilities Maintenance Division to ensure staffing matches service level expectations	The department supports this recommendation. As previously noted, Facilities Maintenance currently has 23 field maintenance employees (Building Trades IV, III or II, Building Maintenance Mechanic IV, III or II). This includes 2 employees managed by the City – working side-by-side with other employees, in both City and School buildings – but formally employed by the Schools. As School employees retire, their replacements are hired as City employees. Reaching an employee count of one field maintenance person/50,000 SF would require a total of 6 additional employees. At $44,550 each (figure used in draft study), the total amount of additional funding required would be $267,300.
52	Include annual facility maintenance and repair needs in the City CIP	The department supports the recommendation that equipment replacement/repair needs submitted during the CIP process be fully funded, but recognize as well that full funding may be difficult to achieve.
	Utilities Operations	
53	Review Enterprise Fund cost allocation methodology	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and will be explored during cost of service study for the utilities.
54	Minimize water system loss by enhancing residential and large meter testing program	Documenting and minimizing water loss has been a priority for Utilities for many years. Utilities supports this recommendation and will continue to implement the program.
	Charlottesville Area Transit	
55	Resume annual transit customer surveys	Transit staff will be working with CA-MPO on a plan to do customer surveys later this calendar year.
56	Approach UVA about increased ridership	This has been discussed with UVA in the past and staff acknowledge that a formal agreement and an alternative pricing structure needs to be agreed upon between the City and UVA.
	Police Department	
57	Adopt the proposed organizational restructuring creating three functional divisions within the Police Department	This recommendation was completed November 2016.
58	Implement a 12-hour shift schedule to create staff capacity for proactive policing efforts	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
59	Track investigative caseload and clearance statistics	Agree that this recommendation will provide commanders with information to properly manage resources. However, clearance rates are a very poor indicator of individual performance but can be useful when assessing specific crimes. New unit and division commander assigned November 2016. Tracking caseload and clearance rates will begin January 2017. In the very near future, the unit commander will be required to provide either a monthly or quarterly report. These details are currently being discussed, with an estimated date of full implementation March 2017.
60	Implement a process for review of patrol investigations by the Investigations Bureau and a quality assurance program for all investigations	This recommendation will be included in the efforts for recommendation #59.
61	Establish standards for timeliness of investigations	This recommendation is already established via formal policy.
62	Update the Police Department Strategic Plan; track performance measures	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
63	Implement an information-led, proactive policing strategy	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
64	Review District boundaries	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
65	Add financial review to spending approval process	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
66	Streamline the reporting process	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
67	Implement a vehicle replacement policy	This recommendation was completed with Fleet in December 2016.
68	Periodically evaluate the Department's take-home vehicle policy	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
69	Review the impact of the Career Development Program	This recommendation is pending to be completed sometime in 2017.
70	Conduct a space needs assessment for Police Headquarters	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.
71	Install appropriate security measures in remote locker rooms and the parking area	This is a viable recommendation and funding for a gate into the parking area was approved as part of the FY 2016 Year End Appropriation in December 2016.
72	Develop a comprehensive false alarm reduction program	Staff believes this is a viable recommendation and should be explored.

Fire Department

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
73	Implement competency-based evaluations of firefighting, HAZMAT, and technical rescue skills	In October 2016, one Firefighter position was moved to the Training Section and has been reclassified to the Captain. The Training Captain has been tasked with developing and implementing a core competency program that addresses all high-risk operations at the individual, company, and battalion level. This program will be rooted in the NFPA standards noted in the narrative.
74	Adopt validated physical agility test for use during the hiring process	The consultant is recommending we adopt the Candidate Physical Agility Test (CPAT). The CPAT was developed over 15 years ago by the International Association of Firefighters (IAFF) and was reviewed by the Department of Justice to ensure a non-discriminatory pre-employment physical agility test. Implementing the CPAT requires a license from the IAFF along with a commitment to fully implement all aspects of the IAFF-IAFC Joint Wellness Fitness Initiative. The challenge with CPAT program implementation is, quite simply, cost. Many departments no longer utilize the CPAT for this very reason. Also, the CPAT has itself been challenged in court.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
75	Partner with CARS to review medical calls for service and evaluate schedule	The City and the Department have been working closely with CARS leadership to implement EMS billing in the City. The current staffing model is being evaluated as well. CARS has recently approached the City to inquire about CFD providing 24-hour coverage. Those discussions are underway.
76	Ensure adopted EMS service level standard for the City of Charlottesville is met	The City and CARS recently developed and agreed to the *Emergency Medical Services Benchmark Service Delivery Level Objectives* document. The service level objectives in this document mirror best-practices for urban/metro EMS systems and are grounded in NFPA, CPSE-CFAI, and AHA standards and guidelines. A new electronic patient care reporting system was placed in service in December, 2016. The department is currently developing reporting tools that will, for the first time in the history of the system, allow for a comprehensive analysis of EMS system performance.
77	Conduct a community risk assessment to inform the work plan of the Fire Prevention Division	The Community Risk Assessment is being completed as part of the re-accreditation process.
78	Establish accurate occupancy inventory and adopt inspection schedule	The CRR section is currently coordinating with Neighborhood Development Services to ensure that the occupancy module of the new Image Trend Elite software package includes a fully updated occupancy inventory that will support a robust risk-based inspection program that will include shift inspectors, company level business inspections and pre-fire planning.
79	Use collected data to determine appropriate staffing level for the Fire Prevention Division	The Community Risk Reduction Section is in the final stages of migrating from paper-based documentation to an electronic records management system. The completed migration will allow for a data-driven analysis of workload and staffing needs.
80	Adopt a preplan maintenance schedule	The CRR section is currently coordinating with Neighborhood Development Services to ensure that the occupancy module of the new Image Trend Elite software package includes a fully updated occupancy inventory that will support a robust risk-based inspection program that will include shift inspectors, company level business inspections and pre-fire planning.
81	Transfer maintenance responsibility for select Fire Department fleet to Fleet Maintenance Division.	CFD generally concurs with this recommendation. Fire departments utilizing centralized repair facilities typically struggle to receive timely service. In order for this recommendation to be successful, there would need to be a very clear understanding, perhaps in the form of an agreed-upon business process or SOP, regarding responsiveness, especially during non-business hours. See recommendation #50 in Public Works for more information.
82	Clarify Emergency Management responsibilities	Staff concurs with this recommendation. The current structure will not support the degree of clarity in command authority that will be required in the case of a major disaster.

Rec #	Recommendation	Staff Comments
83	Civilianize the planning function of the Administration Division	The sole reason for the Planning Battalion Chief's current IT role is due to the IT department's inability to consistently provide adequate support for a 24-hour emergency services organization. While I concur with the consultant's recommendation to civilianize fire department IT functions, this position should be part of the department's FTE complement. The fire department's FY18 budget submission includes a request for a full-time IT Support Technician. Complete details on the scope and scale of fire department hardware and software IT systems requiring support beyond that historically provided by City IT are included in the FY18 Budget supplemental request.